

City of Findlay City Planning Commission

Thursday, January 8, 2015 - 9:00 AM
Municipal Building, Council Chambers

Minutes

(Staff Report Comments from the meeting are incorporated into the minutes in lighter text. Actual minutes begin with the DISCUSSION Section for each item)

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Mayor Lydia Mihalik
Paul Schmelzer
Jackie Schroeder
Joe Opperman
Dan Clinger

STAFF ATTENDING:

Matt Pickett, FFD
Matt Cordonnier, HRPC Director
Steve Wilson, City Engineering Department
Todd Richard
Don Rasmussen

GUESTS:

Don Malarky, Stefanie Griffith, Paul Smith, Tom Shindledecker, Dan Stone, Ron Tipton, Jerry Murray, Edward Kurt, Ken Lather

CALL TO ORDER

ROLL CALL

The following members were present:

Mayor Lydia Mihalik
Paul Schmelzer
Jackie Schroeder
Dan Clinger
Joe Opperman

SWEARING IN

All those planning to give testimony were sworn in by M. Cordonnier.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Dan Clinger said he had one correction on page 6, first paragraph of the December minutes. The minutes state the “east” side of the site and it should be the “west”. Mr. Cordonnier took note and will change in the official minutes. Dan Clinger made a motion to approve the minutes of the December 11, 2014 meeting. Lydia Mihalik seconded. Motion to accept carried 5-0.

NEW ITEMS

1. SITE PLAN APPLICATION #SP-01-2015 filed by MAAPE, LLC, 1930 N. Main Street, Findlay, OH for a veterinary office to be located at 1611 N. Main Street.

HRPC

General Information

The site is located on the northeast corner of North Main Street and Trenton Avenue. The property is zoned C-2. The property to the north and east is zoned I-1 and owned by the City of Findlay Schools. The project is not located in the flood plain.

Parcel History

None

Staff Analysis

The applicant is proposing to construct an approximately 4,000 sf Veterinary Office. All setbacks are met as required.

There is one access point proposed from a shared access with the lot to the south (Rite Aid) from North Main Street. They will be providing 19 parking spaces, which exceeds the minimum required parking.

The lighting plan indicates that the proposed lighting meets the lighting standards. The plan did not indicate the height of the light poles, reminder that the maximum height of the light poles shall not exceed 25 feet.

No sign details were provided in the site plan. Any signage will require a permit from the City of Findlay Zoning Department.

The landscaping plan shows that they are meeting the parking lot screening standards and the building foundation plantings.

Staff Recommendation

HRPC Staff recommends that FCPC recommend approval of the request.

ENGINEERING

The proposed site access connects to the existing Main Street access for the adjacent pharmacy. The site plan eliminates 2 existing curb cuts on Main Street.

Water & Sanitary Sewer – New water service will connect to an existing 2” service. New sanitary service will connect to existing sewer on the east side of North Main Street.

Stormwater Management – Stormwater detention is provided by an on-site facility that meets the City’s standards.

Sidewalks – Existing sidewalks will remain in place, however, the walks crossing the existing

drives onto Main Street are in poor condition and need to be replaced as a condition of approval

Engineering Recommendation: Approval of the plan

The following permits will be required prior to construction:

- Sanitary sewer permit
- Storm sewer permit

An approved Stormwater Pollution Prevention Plan may also be required if more than 1 acre of earth is disturbed by construction

FIRE PREVENTION

Apply for all necessary permits with Wood County Building Department.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends **approval of SITE PLAN APPLICATION #SP-01-2015 for a 4,000 square Veterinary Office located on the northeast corner of Trenton and N. Main Street subject to the following conditions:**

- **Replacement of the sidewalks crossing the existing drives on Main Street (Engineer)**

DISCUSSION

Paul Schmelzer commented that he thinks it is a good looking plan and is a good use in regard to hours of operation being adjacent to the school. He stated there are representatives of the school system here today and he has not heard any negative comments from them. Mr. Schmelzer had one comment for the Engineer. He said it appears that the drive radius may not be completely in the easement. He doesn't see this as a problem. Dan Stone replied that they will look at that and try to keep within the easement area.

Dan Clinger stated that it indicates that there is a no development within the strip behind Rite Aid. Dan Stone stated that they had originally considered an access from Trenton Avenue on that strip. The applicant decided it was not really necessary for the development so they deleted any improvements to that area.

Mr. Clinger also noted that the comments spoke of 19 parking spaces and there are 29. Mr. Cordonnier said he would make note of that.

MOTION

Lydia Mihalik made a motion to approve Site Plan Application #SP-01-2015 subject to:
Replacement of the sidewalks crossing the existing drives on Main Street (Engineer)

2nd: Paul Schmelzer

VOTE: Yay (5) Nay (0) Abstain (0)

2. SITE PLAN APPLICATION #SP-02-2015 filed by Van Horn, Hoover & Associates. Inc. Findlay, OH on behalf the Blanchard Valley Port Authority c/o Marathon Petroleum for a parking garage to be located near East Lincoln Street.

HRPC

General Information

This site is currently a surface parking lot for the Marathon Petroleum Office Buildings. The proposed development will consist of removing the existing parking lot and constructing a parking garage. The property is currently zoned C-3 (Downtown Commercial). To the south and east of the site the properties are zoned C-2 (General Commercial). The property is not located in the 100 year flood plain.

Parcel History

None

Staff Analysis

The applicant is proposing to construct a five level parking garage in the existing surface parking lot. The parking garage meets the building setback of the C-3 zoning district. Ingress and egress to the proposed building is from Lincoln Street and to the now private drive that was formerly Hardin Street. The proposed site plan will remove several of the existing curb cuts onto Lincoln Street, this is viewed to be an improvement to the current layout.

There are no height regulations in the C-3 zoning district.

The structure will have brick veneers that complement the buildings in the area.

Staff Recommendation

HRPC Staff recommends approval of Site Plan # SP-02-2015

ENGINEERING

Access – Two entrances/exits are proposed on Lincoln Street. Multiple existing parking entrances will be eliminated by converting from at grade parking to garage.

Water & Sanitary Sewer – A sanitary sewer is proposed to connect to an existing 12” sewer on Lincoln Street. A domestic water service is proposed to connect to a new 8” waterline to be installed on the north and west sides of the proposed garage.

Stormwater Management – Existing site is 100% impervious; detention is not required.

Sidewalks – Existing sidewalks will remain in place

Engineering Recommendation: Approval of the plan, subject to resolving concerns of access to proposed waterline and fire prevention

The following permits will be required prior to construction:

- An approved Stormwater Pollution Prevention Plan
- Water permits – 1
- Sanitary sewer permit

- Storm sewer permits – 3
- Curb cut permits - 2

FIRE PREVENTION

- Provide proper ingress and egress for FFD apparatus. Additional discussion to commence with Van Horn Hoover & Associates at a later date.
- Fire Department Connection (FDC) to be determined by FFD.
- Apply for all necessary permits with Wood County Building Department.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends **approval of SITE PLAN APPLICATION #SP-02-2015 for a five level parking garage to be located in the current surface parking lot south of the office buildings:**

- **Resolve concerns regarding access to proposed waterlines and fire prevention.**

DISCUSSION

Matt Pickett reported that the Fire Department had been in contact with Marathon and had addressed the hydrants and fire line issues.

Joe Opperman asked how many spaces were proposed in this building. Don Malarky replied that there will be room for 1200 vehicles. There will be 800 in the garage under construction now and an additional 500 surface parking spaces. So there will be 2500 parking spaces on the campus.

Mr. Schmelzer asked if the sewer connection was just for drainage for the elevator. Mr. Malarky stated that it is for drainage off the deck. Dan Stone commented that it will run through an oil and water separator.

Mr. Schmelzer asked about the parking to the north. Don Malarky explained that they would be doing some reconfiguring of the lot. During construction of this building, it will be a “lay down” area. They plan on doing a reconfiguration of the lot to the east as well. He said they plan on coming back to the Commission after these projects are complete and layout the rest of the campus plan with all the landscaping and green scape plans they have.

Dan Clinger stated that when this had first come through he had said he would like to see all the entry points for the surface lots redone and eliminated. He asked if they plan on that. Mr. Malarky and Mr. Smith both replied that that is the plan. Mr. Malarky stated that they will go to more on an internal circulation model. He said he can’t say that they will eliminate all the accesses from Lincoln, but they will reduce the number.

Mr. Opperman asked if the Engineering or Regional Planning Departments had looked at the streets around here that will have nearly 3000 cars coming or going twice a day from these buildings. Mr. Malarky stated that they are really not increasing the number of vehicles per day but they are condensing them onto the campus. Many employees park in the surrounding areas and off the campus site today. He thinks it will be more of an internal circulation and traffic queuing for the company. As far as getting out onto the streets he doesn’t feel it is any different than today. Mr. Smith said it will actually decrease the number of access points people are using today. Mr. Schmelzer stated that Marathon has looked at the times their employees ingress and egress. It is not like a typical shift change. Employees come and go at various times. There will

be improvements done at East Street by Marathon. The city is looking at Blanchard Street and Sandusky Street in upcoming capital improvement projects using ODOT money and Marathon CRA dollars for projects that came out of the traffic impact study.

Dan Clinger commended Marathon for the work they did in making sure the facades are aesthetically pleasing and really enhancing the campus and the community. Paul Schmelzer asked if Mr. Malarky had any idea what the façade enhancements may have added to the budget for these buildings. Mr. Malarky said he would guess 10 to 20 percent in cost.

MOTION

Joe Opperman made a **motion to approve SITE PLAN APPLICATION #SP-02-2105 for the Marathon parking garage to be located near East Lincoln Street.**

2nd: Dan Clinger

VOTE: Yay (5) Nay (0) Abstain (0)

3. PETITION FOR REZONING ZA-01-2015 filed by RCM Architects on behalf of the Findlay City Schools. The applicant is requesting parcels 210001029285 and 210001029286 be rezoned from R-1 residential to I-1 light industrial. The parcels are located at the southeast intersection of Broad Ave. and Bigelow Ave.

HRPC

General Information

The applicant is requesting to rezone the approximately 13 acre parcel from R-1 residential to I-1 light industrial. The land to the east is zoned R-2 residential and to the north O-1 office. The land located to the south is not located in the City of Findlay. To the west is Broad Avenue and I-75. The property is not located in the 100 year flood plain. The Findlay Land Use Plan designates the parcels as single family.

Parcel History

None

Staff Analysis

The City of Findlay Schools propose to use the 13 acre site for a school bus facility. If the terminal were to be constructed as part of a school it would be considered an accessory use to the school and would be allowed in any zoning district that a school could be placed in. Since the proposed use is not an accessory to an on-sight school facility it needs to have a stand-alone zoning classification.

The facility will be located next to existing residential homes. Visual and noise reducing buffers should be in place so that no negative effects are experienced by the neighbors.

Additionally some consideration should be given to the visual appeal from Broad Ave. and I-75.

Staff Recommendation

HRPC Staff would recommend approval of the request to rezone.

ENGINEERING

No objections

FIRE PREVENTION

No Comment

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that FCPC recommend approval to Findlay City Council of **PETITION FOR ZONING AMENDMENT #ZA-01-2015** to rezone parcels **210001029285** and **210001029286** from **R-1 residential** to **I-1 light industrial**. The parcels are located at the southeast intersection of **Broad Ave. and Bigelow Ave.**

DISCUSSION

Dan Clinger asked if adjoining property owners had been notified. Matt Cordonnier explained that it is a part of CPC procedure to notify the abutting owners of any item that is pertinent to them. He had sent letters out before Christmas. Mr. Clinger asked if the letter asked for a response. Mr. Cordonnier replied that an agenda is included with the item relative to them highlighted. Mayor Mihalik asked if there were any replies, questions, phone calls received in regard to this issue. Mr. Cordonnier replied that he had not.

Dan Clinger said that he could see this zoning possibly becoming an issue in the future. He stated that he can see the current applicant being there for an extended period of time. He asked if there is an option to give them a non-conditional use or something without going to the rezoning. Paul Schmelzer stated he had a similar question and it was something he wanted to bring the Law Director in on. Mr. Schmelzer asked if the school currently owns the property. It was stated that the zone change is an option to owning. Mr. Schmelzer asked Don Rasmussen what implications there would be to a deed restriction that it could only be used for the bus garage. Mr. Rasmussen commented that if they are willing to do that, it will not affect the zoning. Mr. Schmelzer said the problem is they rezone the property not yet owned by the school, but there is no site plan at this time. If the deed restriction is put in then it would eliminate any other industrial use from being able to use the land. Mr. Schmelzer stated that his point for further discussion to City Council would be to examine the possibility of a deed restriction on the property upon transfer. Mr. Schmelzer feels this would be a much less egregious use than could go there under I-1. In the summer it will be dormant and other times it will be used in early morning and during afternoon hours when many residents are not home yet.

Joe Opperman asked what kind of investment they are talking here. Jerry Murray said they had not run the numbers yet as to what the school would be investing in the location. He stated that Findlay City Schools is very eager to be a good neighbor. The purpose today is to see if this will go with a favorable recommendation to Planning & Zoning and City Council. Then they can move forward with the purchase under whatever terms are necessary. They understand that they will have to come in for site plan review.

Ken Lather came forward on behalf of the property owner. He stated that they would no objection to the zoning not being effective until deed transfer. The owner does not want the zone change unless the sale is going forward.

A representative for the Nazarene Church asked to speak. He said he is not for or against the proposal but is surprised that there are not more neighbors here today. He stated there had been a meeting at his church with several surrounding owners (mainly in the condominium section). They were supposed to talk with the school about this. He said he feels there are people that

would be impacted by the traffic that will be on Northtowne Drive.

Ronald Tipton spoke and stated he is a resident on Northtowne Drive. He said his concern is the traffic flow. He heard there are 50 buses that will go in and out every morning and afternoon and also the 50 employees every morning and afternoon. He stated that Northtowne Drive is in Liberty Township. He said the superintendent had said there would be easy access to Glenwood Middle School from this site. Mr. Tipton feels that the buses will be travelling Northtowne to Melrose to Main Street because it would be the shortest way there. He has concerns about diesel emissions. He is also concerned about the water. Dalzell Ditch is in the site. There are always concerns with the flooding due to it needing cleaning. There are concerns with the detention. Will there be fuel on the property? Will there be tankers in and out every month, fuel tanks on the property? He is not sure these are real concerns right now, but he knows the traffic will be a mess. He stated that the condo owners were concerned about their property values if the garage is built. He stated he wished the school would have considered the residents in this area. He feels there are many more properties, even on Main Street. Mr. Tipton said that Glenwood could have been moved forward and a bus garage put behind the school there. There was the land that the veterinarian will be building on also. He says there is a lot of wasted area in front of Glenwood now. Mr. Tipton noted that Dow is leaving and that land may be available. Mr. Tipton asked if he understands that this cannot be developed as a residential area. Mr. Schmelzer stated that it could be developed residential. Mr. Tipton recalled that 10-15 years ago they wanted to develop as some kind of lower income housing. He feels the owner could consider a residential development, perhaps more condos, etc.

Mr. Schmelzer said he would like to address a couple of questions so Mr. Tipton could walk out with some information. He said that Glenwood doesn't have as much available acreage as he may think on their site. He also stated that the school did not have any control over the parcel beside Rite Aid at the time or now. He said Mr. Tipton does have a valid point about residential development. That is what it is zoned for now. However, the current property owner is not a developer, he is a seller. Mr. Schmelzer said it is his opinion, but if it is developed residentially, it would be done so with the most density possible. Because of its location it would be a tenant based development in his opinion. He doesn't think it would be similar in character to the homes in the area now. Mr. Tipton asked why he felt that way. Mr. Schmelzer said it is a marketability issue. It is so close to the interstate and Broad Avenue. He said the "pristine" area that Mr. Tipton referred to would disappear with that development. He said that many of the other questions he had would be good to bet together with the neighbors and discuss once the site plan is being looked at. The school does not want to go to that level of detail and spend that type of dollars and the hours required without knowing if the use is going to be supported.

Jerry Murray thanked Mr. Tipton for his comments. He stated that the use may not be favorable to Mr. Tipton, but Findlay City Schools is very concerned with being a good neighbor. He said they will work on screening. The woods behind his home are trying to be maintained as much as possible. He said they have to detain water before it enters the creek. All these issues will be addressed and they will be very sensitive to noise factors, lighting factors and other things. They will work with the neighbors on those issues.

Mayor Mihalik pointed out in regard to Dalzell Ditch concerns that the City is in the process of addressing those. They have petitioned the County Commissioners to clean the ditch and are pretty optimistic that this will work out and we can eliminate some of the flooding issues. They have already done some work to remove some culverts that were put on over the ditch by a property owner that had caused a lot of back up and issues. Ms. Mihalik stated they are seeing a lot more flow now.

Ed Kurt, superintendent of Findlay City Schools, stated they currently do not have tanks at their site and would not have them here. He said Mr. Schmelzer was correct in that they have not gone into detail yet on the site and they will work with the neighbors and the City on the location of accesses. If it would be more conducive to turn it to Broad, they would be willing to do that. He said they want to be really good neighbors, they do not want to store fuel there, and they want to have the access in a location that works better for everybody.

Mayor Mihalik said that her concern goes back to the discussion between Mr. Schmelzer and Mr. Rasmussen about how we can control that if the zoning is I-1 that it is for this particular use only. We hear that the property owner is not interested in rezoning it unless he can sell it, but how can we insure that takes place. Mr. Kurt replied that they are not interested in buying it unless they can put the bus garage there.

Mr. Tipton said he appreciated that they had the concern on the zoning issue. He would certainly not want to see anything far worse go in there if it is not developed as the bus garage.

MOTION

Paul Schmelzer made a **motion to recommend approval of PETITION FOR REZONING ZA-01-2015 to rezone parcels 210001029285 and 210001029286 from R-1 Single Family Residential to I-1 Light Industrial to Findlay City Council with the condition that it is only rezoned if it is transferred to Findlay City Schools.** Mr. Rasmussen asked if that is with a deed restriction. Matt Cordonnier replied perhaps with whatever mechanism is needed to insure that. He said they need to do some research to make sure the proper mechanism is in place.

2nd: Dan Clinger

Todd Richard commented that there may be some things to consider with noise. The busses will probably be warmed up early in the morning, there are probably back up alarms, which may need to be considered on the impact on the neighborhood.

Dan Clinger said he assumed this was not an enclosed garage but more of a covered shelter for the busses. Jerry Murray stated it is an enclosed maintenance garage. The busses are parked and there is a covered walkway from the busses to the building. There will be break rooms, locker rooms, whatever for the bus drivers as well as office space. There will be two maintenance bays there. Mr. Clinger said so the area where the busses actually park is just a partially covered area. Mr. Murray confirmed yes.

Mr. Murray referred to a comment of Mr. Cordonnier in his report that consideration should be given to the visual appeal from Broad Avenue. He stated that it is really not very visible from Interstate 75 now. Matt Cordonnier stated that there is a grade change there but they try to be conscience of the "face" of Findlay as 70,000 cars drive by on the Interstate. He said he was referring to using the grade change as well as some landscaping so the passersby do not see a big parking lot and building. Mr. Murray said landscaping would be planned with trees. He also feels some will be needed along the utility easement on the east side that abuts the homes there. He is aware that the lighting will have to have zero light pollution off the site.

Mr. Tipton thought that a wall would be going along I-75 so there may not be a visual issue there.

Mr. Clinger said he thought that landscaping and screening requirements in the code may require a 6' fence or mound here. He isn't sure that would do a lot of good here where things sit so low. But additional trees, etc would definitely help. Mr. Cordonnier stated that the buffer requirements according to the code would be between the residential areas and the site.

The Nazarene Church representative said that most anything would make the site look better than it does now, but his main concern will be the traffic. He said he had heard that Northtowne might be widened to put in a turn lane.

VOTE: Yay (5) Nay (0) Abstain (0)

ADJOURNMENT

With no further business the meeting was adjourned.

Lydia L. Mihalik
Mayor

Paul E. Schmelzer, P.E., P.S.
Service-Safety Director