

FINDLAY CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES

REGULAR SESSION

SEPTEMBER 6, 2022

COUNCIL CHAMBERS

ROLL CALL of 2022-2023 Councilmembers:

PRESENT: Bauman, Frische, Greeno, Hellmann, Niemeyer, Palmer, Russel, Slough, Warnecke, Wobser

ABSENT: none

President of Council Pro-Tem Russel explained that he becomes the President of Council when either the Mayor or President of Council are absent. In tonight's case, Mayor Muryn is on the road which means President of Council Harrington becomes Acting Mayor, causing him to become President of Council Pro-Tem.

He opened the meeting with the Pledge of Allegiance and a moment of silence.

ACCEPTANCE/CHANGES TO PREVIOUS CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES:

- Councilman Slough moved to accept the August 16, 2022 Public Hearing minutes to rezone 909 Broad Avenue via Ordinance No. 2022-074, seconded by Councilman Greeno. All were in favor. Filed.
- Councilman Slough moved to accept the August 16, 2022 Regular Session City Council meeting minutes, seconded by Councilman Greeno. All were in favor. Filed.

ADD-ON/REPLACEMENT/REMOVAL FROM THE AGENDA:

Councilman Wobser moved to add the following to tonight's agenda, seconded by Councilman Slough. All were in favor. Filed.

ADD-ONS:

1. Letter from Service-Safety Director Martin – liquid sodium permanganate bid for 2023 (*REPORTS OF MUNICIPAL OFFICERS AND MUNICIPAL DEPARTMENTS section*)
2. carry-over legislation cover sheet (*LEGISLATION section*)
3. Ordinance No. 2022-094 (*LEGISLATION section*) - liquid sodium permanganate bid for 2023

PROCLAMATIONS: none

RECOGNITION/RETIREMENT RESOLUTIONS: none

PETITIONS: none

WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS: none

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS: none

REPORTS OF MUNICIPAL OFFICERS AND MUNICIPAL DEPARTMENTS:

City Planning Commission agenda – September 8, 2022; **minutes** – August 11, 2022. Filed.

Treasurer's Reconciliation Report – July 31, 2022. Filed.

Board of Zoning Appeals minutes – April 14, 2022; May 12, 2022; July 14, 2022. Filed.

City Auditor Staschiak – Resolution accepting millage rates and amounts

The County Budget Commission has completed their work and returned our Certificate of Estimated Resources for our 2022 budget. Our tax millage has been certified exactly as submitted; 2.6 mills for the General Fund and 0.3 mills each for Police and Fire Pension Funds to a total of 3.2 mills, approximately \$3MM (three million dollars). Local government money is estimated to be \$685,000.00 for next year subject to likely adjustments by the State. Council should now accept the amounts and levy the tax rates as certified by the Budget Commission. The proper Resolution must be adopted and returned to the County Auditor no later than September 30, 2022. Legislation for this is requested and only requires one reading. Resolution No. 023-2022 was created.

Discussion:

Councilman Wobser moved to have the letter read, seconded by Councilman Palmer. All were in favor. The Council Clerk read the letter in its entirety. Filed.

City Engineer Kalb – Ohio Public Works Commission Grant Application Bernard Avenue Waterline Replacement (35724200)

The City of Findlay Engineering Department is preparing to submit an annual grant application to the Ohio Public Works Commission (OPWC). The application will be for a waterline replacement on Bernard Avenue (from Crystal Avenue to Vincent Street). The waterline on Bernard Avenue is currently a six inch (6") line that is in need of replacement, and as part of this project, the waterline will be upgraded to an eight inch (8") main line. Legislation authorizing City Representatives to execute the necessary grant application(s) and/or agreement(s) to receive the grant funding is requested. Ordinance No. 2022-086 was created. Filed.

City Engineering Kalb – West Lincoln Street Storm Sewer, Project No. 35521700

As authorized by Ordinance No. 2022-025, a bid opening for this project was held on August 25, 2022. Bids were received from three (3) potential contractors with the bid amounts ranging from one hundred eighty-one thousand one hundred four dollars and forty-four cents to four hundred twenty-five thousand seven hundred thirty dollars and eleven cents (\$181,104.44 - \$425,730.11). The lowest and best bid was received from Hohenbrink Excavating, LLC or Findlay, Ohio. Twenty thousand dollars (\$20,000.00) was previously appropriated to the project for design and advertising. An additional appropriation is now needed to cover the City’s portion of the construction cost and provide a contingency for the project. Legislation authorizing the Mayor, Service-Safety Director and/or City Engineer to enter into contracts and to appropriate and transfer funds is requested. Ordinance No. 2022-087 was created.

FROM: Sewer Fund – Stormwater Restricted Account \$ 200,000.00
TO: W Lincoln St Storm Sewer, Project No. 35521700 \$ 200,000.00

Filed.

City Engineering Kalb – Engineering GPS Rover

The City of Findlay Engineering Department has recently sent the GPS Rover into Precision Laser due to inaccurate readings and software issues. After evaluating the GPS Rover, Precision Laser informed the City of Findlay that the rover is needing a part that is no longer available due to the age of the rover itself. The Engineering Department uses the GPS Rover on a weekly basis and will be needing a new GPS Rover to replace the old one. Funds are now being requested to purchase a new GPS Rover in order to continue to perform in-house surveying and take accurate readings on unknown lines. Legislation authorizing the Mayor, Service-Safety Director, and/or City Engineer to enter into contract and to appropriate and transfer funds is requested. Ordinance No. 2022-088 was created.

FROM: CIT Fund – Capital Improvements Restricted Account \$ 30,000.00
TO: Engineering #21021000-other \$ 30,000.00

Discussion:

Councilman Hellmann asked what a rover is. City Engineer Kalb explained that it is a stick-like end (satellite on top) of the device Surveyors carry around. It is the GPS Rover that is used weekly for locating lines. When force main lines are located, elevations and coordinates are taken for accurate readings, but the current GPS Rover was giving inaccurate readings, so it was sent to the company that the City goes through for recalibration where they determined that the 2008 part needs replaced, but is no longer made. It is used every day and is a very expensive small piece of high tech equipment. Councilman Hellmann asked if this takes the place of the old transit. City Engineer Kalb replied that is correct. it only requires one employee to use it and does not required more than one employee.

Councilman Russel asked if this needs to be passed tonight. City Engineer Kalb replied that there is a 30-day price hold on it, so if it could be adopted yet tonight, the rover would be obtained faster, but passing it tonight is not completely necessary. Councilman Russel asked what is being done in the interim without it. City Engineer Kalb replied they are having to mark them on a set of plans, putting a pin in, and then will come back when the elevations are known and where it is at. It is a little more work than what is normally done.

Councilman Wobser asked if it is not being bid out because it is under the fifty thousand dollar (\$50,000.00) threshold. City Engineer Kalb replied is correct and because the City will be using the same vendor. It will be basically the same part, just a newer model. They had been using a R8 and will now be using a R12. Councilman Wobser asked how long it will take to get the R12. City Engineer Kalb replied it is in stock, so he can purchase it as soon as he can obtain a purchase order. Filed.

City Engineering Kalb – HAN-Greenway Trail Phase II, Project No. 31993800

This project is for extending a ten foot (10') multi-use trail from the Eastpoint Area to County Road 236. The project is wrapping up design, but due to requirements/restrictions from the OEPA, additional design work is needed to finish the project. Fund are now being requested to cover the additional design work that is needed for this project. Legislation to appropriate and transfer funds is requested. Ordinance No. 2022-089 was created.

FROM: CIT Fund – Capital Improvements Restricted Account \$ 18,000.00
TO: HAN-Greenway Trail Phase II, Project No. 31993800 \$ 18,000.00

Filed.

City Engineering Kalb – Fire House Bunk Room, Project No. 31924900

The City of Findlay Fire Department is developing plans to provide individual sleeping quarters at each station that will be partitioned off by prefabricated wall sections and will not require Wood County inspection or rerouting of the existing HVAC system. These sleeping quarters will reduce any privacy concerns with a mixed-gender workforce and will provide personnel with an individual area to sleep. Legislation authorizing the Mayor, Service-Safety Director and/or City Engineer to enter into contracts, as well as appropriate and transfer funds is requested. Ordinance No. 2022-090 was created.

FROM: CIT Fund – Capital Improvements Restricted Account \$ 42,000.00
TO: Fire House Bunk Rooms, Project No. 31924900 \$ 42,000.00

Filed.

Service-Safety Director Martin – fiber loop to north and south water towers for VHF Radio System

The fiber loop to the north and south water towers for the VHF radio system is almost complete, but there is not enough funding to finish it. The fiber has been ran to both towers and all that needs to be completed is splicing into the main fiber lines to tie into the radio system equipment at both towers, and to complete the agreement with Findlay City Schools for the use of their fiber lines in conjunction with the south tower portion. The cost was to be provided from Findlay City Schools, but was unknown during the initial planning. The following additional funds are needed in order to complete the project:

- \$14,646.36 = 30 year lease with Findlay City Schools for use of their three (3) fiber lines. A thirty (30) year one-time cost.
- \$4,500.00 = TSC/Ken Myers Construction splicing cost.
- \$933.75 = P&R Communication tie in to the VHR radio system

Total \$20,080.11

\$3,105.33 is already appropriated with a request for an additional \$18,000.00 in order to complete the project which includes an additional \$1,000.00 for unforeseen cost increases. Utilizing 2023 Capital funds for this will only cost the City more in the long run based on the impact that inflation has already had on this project. Legislation to appropriate and transfer funds is requested. Ordinance No. 2022-091 was created.

FROM:	CIT Fund – Capital Improvement Restricted Account	\$ 18,000.00
TO:	VHF Radio System, <i>Project No. 31983000</i>	\$ 18,000.00

Discussion:

Councilwoman Frische asked what the cost was when the fiber line was originally put in for Findlay City Schools and when they entered into the contract for it. She asked what all is included in the cost. Service-Safety Director Martin replied that there were different phases going back to 2018. It began with then Service-Safety Director Schmelzer coming before Council asking for the original appropriation of around two hundred seventy-five thousand dollars (\$275,000.00), then asked for the second phase amount of around three hundred thousand dollars (\$300,000.00). This request was not included in the original lease agreement with Findlay City Schools, nor the tying in and splicing of it (i.e. tying in loose ends) to finalize the project. The fiber line was ran and this is just to finish up the loose ends of the project. Councilwoman Frische replied that she thought the City already purchased three (3) strands which is why she was surprised to see a thirty (30) year lease. She asked if the two hundred seventy-five thousand dollars (\$275,000.00) and the three hundred thousand dollars (\$300,000.00) was just to run the lines to the tower in both directions. Service-Safety Director Martin replied that is correct. Councilwoman Frische asked if an agreement ever existed. Service-Safety Director Martin replied there was.

Councilman Wobser asked if the original agreement was for when the fiber line was originally put in 2018. Service-Safety Director Martin replied that is correct. Councilman Wobser asked what tonight’s request is for. Service-Safety Director Martin replied that it allows the City to use the VHF radio system for safety services and creates redundancy in communication capabilities for City services to be able to communicate. Councilman Wobser asked if this will be used when the other system goes down. Service-Safety Director Martin replied that the MARCS radio system is a state-wide system that was activated almost two (2) decades ago. The VHF system provides a better communication local capability for City employees. With the technology that is now available, when it is implemented, it can reduce the use of the MARCS system with the service side and some other areas. For instance, when there is a large scale incident, there has to be a mutual aid from the State of other agencies coming in, which is when the MARCS system plays its role. Once the VHF system is up and running, they will be able to evaluate the need for the scope of the MARCS system that City currently has, which will hopefully allow for cost savings.

Councilwoman Frische asked if there is a fee to operate this and if there is a third party available to run the equipment, phones and the MARCS system. Service-Safety Director Martin replied it is not phones. It is VHF radios. Once the equipment is purchased, it will run off the frequency. It requires a one-time purchase of a radio (the City already has the radios) because we already have a VHF system. It requires the upgrading of the VHF system capability within the existing system. Councilwoman Frische asked if it is like an internet service and asked if there are any additional fees. Service-Safety Director Martin replied no. Filed.

City Engineer Kalb – Ohio Public Works Commission (OPWC) grant application – Blanchard Street Waterline Replacement Phase II

The City of Findlay Engineering Department is preparing to submit the annual grant applications to the Ohio Public Works Commission (OPWC). In addition to the Bernard Avenue Waterline application, The City of Findlay Engineering Department would like to submit a second project for consideration. This application will be for a waterline replacement on Blanchard Street (from Sixth Street to the south water tower). The waterline on Blanchard Street is currently a ten inch (10”) line that is in need of replacement and as part of this project, it will be upgraded to a sixteen inch (16”) main line. Legislation authorizing City Representatives to execute the necessary grant application(s) and/or agreement(s) to receive the grant funding is requested. Ordinance No. 2022-092 was created. Filed.

Findlay Fire Department Activities Report – August 2022. Filed.

City Income Tax Monthly Collection Report – August 2022. Filed.

Mayor Muryn – KPIs

The year to date 2022 Key Performance Indicators (KPI) are now available on the City's website:

<https://www.findlayohio.com/government/transparency-performance>. The attached Enterprise Dashboard shows a few key metrics.

Discussion:

Councilman Hellmann pointed out that the report looks as though the City is running about twenty-five percent (25%) behind with Engineering miles paved and asked if there is a reason for that. City Engineer Kalb replied that the report is up to date as of a couple of weeks ago and the numbers will go up a little bit and may not meet the goal because the dollar does not stretch as far as it used to. More funds have been applied to that area that has always been funded as one million twenty-five thousand dollars (\$1,025,000.00). When he first came on to the City, the cost of replacing curbs and gutters was eighteen dollars per foot (\$18.00/ft) and is now twenty-five dollars per foot (\$25.00/ft). Asphalt is around one hundred forty-two dollars per cubic yard (\$142.00/cu yd) and is now between one hundred sixty-six dollars to one hundred seventy dollars per cubic yard (\$166.00-\$170.00/cu yd). The dollar is not stretching as far as it used to. The biggest increase in costs is because concrete is used more than asphalt. More funds are needed when the year requires more curb work and concrete drives, but in the long run, it saves more roadways because of the ability of drainage. The work that needs done to City streets, curbs and driveways are reviewed in the ten (10) year plan when it is determined if the amounts need to be increased in order to stay within the goals. Councilman Hellmann asked if it is not necessarily a production piece on the contractor's side and is more on pricing. City Engineer Kalb replied it's a cost.

Councilman Wobser asked if the City was not essentially able to do as many lane miles because there wasn't as much money. City Engineer Kalb replied that the same amount of money is not stretching as far as it used to. Councilman Wobser noted that the prebudget meeting is towards the end of this month when it will be determined how much money will be allocated into capital spending from next year's budget. He asked if Council should recommend more money for capital projects since the dollar is not giving as many lane miles as it has in the past and to avoid getting behind on paving projects. City Engineer Kalb replied he will look into it.

Councilman Bauman asked if the current rate is one hundred sixty-six dollars to one hundred seventy dollars per cubic foot (\$166.00-\$170.00/cu ft). City Engineer Kalb replied cubic yard (cu yd). Councilman Bauman asked how much it is for per lane mile for pavement down on the road. City Engineer Kalb replied it is around one million dollars a mile (\$1,000,000.00/mile) including curbs which consists of building completely new roads. For example, it costs roughly one hundred seventy to one hundred eighty thousand dollars (\$175,000.00-\$180,000.00) to curb and pave East Lima Street. It costs forty thousand dollars (\$40,000.00) just to pave an inch and a half (1 ½") on Interstate Drive where the Outback Restaurant is, which does not include concrete work. The cost is determined how thick the pavement will be. Generally, an inch to an inch and a half (1-1.5") is what is done, depending on the traffic on each particular road. He will provide a rough estimate to Council for the cost of pavement per lane mile.

Councilwoman Frische asked if the City is getting less in grant funding for projects. The current Administration is very heavy in getting grants and matching funds, and asked if the City is obtaining less of them, or if the City is obtaining more grants and matching funds and using less of City funds. City Engineer Kalb replied he does not think the City is getting less money for the resurfacing program. Grant funding comes into play with the numbers. For instance, if ODOT does an urban pavement project where the City is only paying twenty percent (20%) of lane miles, the City is only paying twenty cents on every dollar, which helps the City's budget, but does not happen every year. When the Blanchard Street project was done, it consisted of a lot of lane miles, but had grant funding to help. The City's costs will fluctuate depending on the amount of lane miles a project includes. If looking strictly at just the annual resurfacing program of what is done on City streets, costs have gone up, so the City is stretching the dollar as far as it can. The City Street Department helps with a lot of projects when they have the capabilities to do the work, which helps cut down costs. It is listed in the bid specifications whenever City Departments are going to be doing any part of a project (i.e. milling, etc.) which is not always the bulk of the work, but a thousand dollars (\$1,000.00) here and there adds up quickly, especially on new streets. He does not believe the City is getting less grant funding than it has before and is probably actually getting more.

City Auditor Staschiak suggested that Council have a streets committee meeting to briefly discuss how the Auditor's Office should balance the life of a street. The State Auditor recommends the life of a street as fifteen (15) years, not twenty (20) or twenty-five (25) years which means the On an average year, the City paves one-fifteenth (1/15) of lane miles each year. In comparison, crack sealing, and much like caulking, is applied to a coat of paint on a wooden or cedar sided house that goes a long way to keep water out of the road which keeps it from alligating and eliminates the need to grind and repave it. Any guidance Council can give City Engineer Kalb on how to allocate dollars, with a plan or approach on how to use the money since it is a newer thing that Council has not seen in a long time with this type of inflation, would be helpful. Filed.

Service-Safety Director Martin – pebble lime

The City of Findlay has begun the process of bidding chemicals, materials, and services that are done annually at this time. Requests for addendums to contracts have been sent to companies who are eligible to extend their contracts for calendar year 2023 at the same pricing as the original contract. The City of Findlay entered into a contract with Greer Lime Company for its pebble lime purchases at a price of \$167.12 per ton for calendar year 2021 and extended the contract for another calendar year at the same price. They are eligible to extend the contract for one (1) additional year (calendar year 2023). Prices for pebble lime have increased at an unprecedented rate over the past year and continue to rise. Greer Lime Company is not able to extend the contract at the same price, however, considering the longstanding business relationship they have with the City, and knowing that other entities are facing the same challenges, Greer Lime Company has asked to be able to extend the contract for one (1) year (calendar year 2023) offering a minor price increase to \$188.00/ton for calendar year 2023). If not acceptable, Greer Lime Company stated that they look forward to participating in the bid process. The City of Findlay purchases approximately 1,100 tons of pebble lime each year. There is a savings of extending the contract with Greer Lime Company for one (1) year (calendar year 2023) with a minor price increase to \$188.00/ton vs. bidding it out at the average current market bid rate of \$230.00/ton is \$46,200.00. Legislation authorizing the Service-Safety Director to extend the contract with Greer Lime Company for one (1) year at a price of \$188.00/ton for pebble lime is requested. [Ordinance No. 2022-093 was created.](#)

Discussion:

Councilman Wobser noted that Service-Safety Director Martin mentioned in both this letter and also the liquid sodium permanganate letter that the contractors are willing to renew their contracts with a slight increase from this year's prices. Service-Safety Director Martin replied that is correct. Councilman Wobser asked why the pebble lime contractor is willing to sell their product to the City if they can sell it at a larger market rate. Service-Safety Director Martin replied that is the same question he asked himself and also asked an in-house expert that deals with this all the time. They are willing to do so because of their long-standing relationship with the City. They understand the situation and do not know what the market is going to do and are willing to deviate from the existing contract and are willing to offer it to the City at a reduced rate, but if the City does not want to go that route, they are willing to be in the bid process with the City paying what the market is now. Their good relationship with the City is what is creating this opportunity. Councilman Wobser asked if this were to go out to bid if the City would be able to get a better price than the one hundred eighty-eight dollar (\$188.00) price Greer Lime Company is able to give the City. He asked if there is any other company that would also want the City's business. Service-Safety Director Martin replied that the market price is two hundred thirty dollars (\$230.00) per ton, so bid prices will be somewhere in that vicinity. Councilman Wobser asked if this were to go out to bid if the City is confident that no other company would be able to provide their bid cost close to the one hundred eighty-eight dollar (\$188.00) bid that Greer Lime Company is offering. Service-Safety Director Martin replied yes. Councilman Wobser asked if it is the same situation for the liquid sodium permanganate request. Service-Safety Director Martin replied that is correct.

Councilwoman Frische asked where someone can access and view the market rate. Service-Safety Director Martin replied it can be looked up. Councilwoman Frische asked if other carriers' rate can be looked up. Service-Safety Director Martin replied it is like looking at fuel prices in that you can see what the market is. Councilwoman Frische asked if other carriers' rates can be seen if it is able to be contracted without going out for bid. Water Treatment Plant (WTP) Superintendent Phillips replied they are able to see what other companies are bidding currently on both the permanganate and the pebble lime and what other municipalities currently have already opened bids for 2023 on what other companies for the exact same product are bidding at the current time.

Councilman Wobser asked if the City asked Greer Lime Company what their rates will be for 2024. WTP Superintendent Phillips replied that in both situations, they are in the third year of the original agreement, so in the fourth year, it has to go out to bid. 2023 renewals are a one-time opportunity to extend the contracts one more year to fulfill the third year. Councilman Wobser asked if he is understanding correctly that the original contracts were for three (3) years with 2023 being the third year and then having to rebid in 2024. WTP Superintendent Phillips replied that is correct. Councilman Wobser asked if there really was a contract since they changed the prices. WTP Superintendent Phillips replied that is correct. Councilman Wobser asked if it was really a one year contract since they can come in at any point in time and change the price, in which they did the third year. He asked if the rest of the language in the contract was the same for this year 2022. He asked if they could have increased their prices for 2022 at the end of 2021 given the contract language. WTP Superintendent Phillips replied that is correct. Councilman Wobser asked if it was really only a one year contract. Service-Safety Director Martin replied that if the City does not want to accept their offer to continue their contract for 2023, they are willing to place a bid when the City rebids it. Councilman Wobser replied that is not his point. His point is that he is trying to understand if the City truly believes that this is the best price that can be obtained at this point in time and if there is a three (3) year contract that is up for repricing at the end of every year, which is really a one year contract in that either party in the contract could leave the contract given their prices. He asked if either party could walk away in year two (2) of a three (3) year contract. He asked if a 2024 bid is even needed and asked why it is a three (3) year contract if it has to be rebid at the end of three (3) years when it wasn't even really a three (3) year contract. Service-Safety Director Martin replied that he cannot answer that because he was not with the City three (3) years ago, but that all contracts have outs. Greer Lime Company will execute the out if the City is not going to agree to the price increase. The market is what it is. Costs are up, so they offered to meet the City in the middle and offered the one hundred eighty-eight dollar (\$188.00) price. Councilman Wobser replied that he has no issue with the price that has been negotiated. His question is why they won't extend the price through 2024. Service-Safety Director Martin replied that he has not had that conversation. Knowing the market volatility, no one is willing to look past the near future based on what everyone is experiencing.

Councilman Russel asked if the State of Ohio, that buys cooperatively, also deals with any of these types of chemicals. WTP Superintendent Phillips replied no, not to his knowledge.

Councilwoman Frische pointed out that the City was not given a very good deal/ The City has been doing business with them, but are now increasing the price. She asked that since everything is now volatile, if the City should be trying to negotiate a two (2) year term instead so that it is the same rate for 2024. She asked if the City can go back to them and try to lock in a 2024 rate especially since prices are volatile. Service-Safety Director Martin replied that they will not lock in 2024 prices as they are barely able to look past 2022 which is why they are offering these prices now for 2023 and then will go out to bid for this to the open market with all contractors able to provide their prices for 2024. Councilwoman Frische asked if bids will go out sooner to obtain better pricing. WTP Superintendent Phillips replied no. The City is trying to get prices now so that the right amount of funds can be budgeted to handle any increases. Filed.

Service-Safety Director Martin – liquid sodium permanganate

The City of Findlay has begun the process for bidding the chemical/material/services that are done annually at this time. Requests for addendums to contracts have been sent to companies who are eligible to extend the contracts for calendar year 2023 at the same pricing as the original contract. The City of Findlay entered into a contract with Carus LLC for its liquid sodium permanganate purchases at a price of \$10.25/gallon for calendar year 2022 and are eligible to extend the contract for two (2) one-year extensions (calendar year 2023 and 2024). Prices for liquid sodium permanganate have increased at an unprecedented rate over the past year and continue to rise. Carus LLC is not able to extend the contract at the same price, however, they have asked to be able to extend the contract for one year (calendar year 2023) offering a price increase to \$11.41/gallon for calendar year 2023. If not acceptable, they will participate in the bid process.

The City of Findlay purchases approximately 15,000 gallons of liquid sodium permanganate each year. The savings of extending the contract with Carus LLC for one year (calendar year 2023) with a price increase to \$11.41/gallon vs bidding it out at the average current market bid rate of \$18.86/gallon is \$111,750.00. Legislation authorizing the Service-Safety Director to extend the contract with Carus LLC for one (1) year at a price of \$11.41/gallon for liquid sodium permanganate is requested. Ordinance No. 2022-094 was created.

COMMITTEE REPORTS:

The **STRATEGIC PLANNING COMMITTEE** met on August 21, 2022 to review and approve the final action plan to go to the public for review and comment.

We recommend to continue the strategic planning process.

Councilman Wobser moved to adopt the committee report, seconded by Councilman Hellmann. All were in favor. Filed.

The **STREETS, SIDEWALKS & PARKING COMMITTEE** met on August 22, 2022 to discuss carriage/service walks.

We recommend the Administration look up existing case law, jurisdictions that have been liable for carriage walk issues, and defined what a carriage walk is.

Councilman Palmer moved to adopt the committee report, seconded by Councilman Bauman. All were in favor. Filed.

The **WATER AND SEWER COMMITTEE** met on August 23, 2022 to a CSO long-term plan.

We recommend no committee report.

Discussion:

Councilwoman Frische asked why the committee met for an hour and doesn't have a committee report. Councilman Russel replied because the committee made no recommendation and there is nothing to report. The committee had a conversation about the CSO long term plan. Councilwoman Frische asked for details on what happened in that meeting so she understands some of the discussion. President of Council Pro-Tem Russel asked if that discussion can be done between her and Councilman Greeno as he is the chair of the committee. Councilwoman Frische replied no, it should be on the record as there was an hour meeting with no recommendation on the committee report, but was discussed. She would like to know, and believes the community would like to know. Councilman Greeno replied that the committee talked about the application and the implementation of the CSO long-term control plan and the different aspects of it. There was nothing to report on. It was a committee meeting for a discussion about it. There were some discrepancies in it, but are working through them. Councilwoman Frische asked if there was a timeline to have it done by. Councilman Greeno replied no, there is no timeline. Filed.

LEGISLATION:

RESOLUTIONS:

RESOLUTION NO. 023-2022 (*millage rates & amounts*) **requires one (1) reading**

first reading - adopted

A RESOLUTION ACCEPTING THE AMOUNTS AND RATES AS DETERMINED BY THE BUDGET COMMISSION AND AUTHORIZING THE NECESSARY TAX LEVIES AND CERTIFYING THEM TO THE COUNTY AUDITOR.

Councilman Wobser moved to adopt the Resolution, seconded by Councilman Palmer. Ayes: Bauman, Frische, Greeno, Hellmann, Niemeyer, Palmer, Russel, Slough, Warnecke, Wobser. The Resolution was declared adopted and is recorded in Resolution Volume XXXV, and is hereby made a part of the record.

RESOLUTION NO. 024-2022 (*BWC – U-69 coverage*) **requires one (1) reading**

first reading - adopted

A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND/OR SERVICE-SAFETY DIRECTOR OF FINDLAY, OHIO TO ENTER INTO AN AGREEMENT WITH THE OHIO BUREAU OF WORKERS COMPENSATION FOR U-69 COVERAGE.

Councilman Slough moved to adopt the Resolution, seconded by Councilman Baumann.

Discussion:

Councilman Russel asked what U-69 coverage is. City Auditor Staschiak explained that the courts have a desire to institute community service. In order to do so, there is an extension of the Workers' Compensation program that must be used. He discussed the risks and concerns with the Judges, so they are well aware that this is an extension of the City's Workers' Compensation program. Any accidents, incidents, or anything that occurs that could impact the City's experience will end up being a cost City-wide. The Judges have good sense to move forward. Either way, it was important because this arm of the Workers' Compensation program hadn't been renewed in almost a decade since it had been used in Municipal Court. It was time to update it with significant changes in State law. This piece of legislation allows the City to move forward City-wide with this program so that Municipal Court has proper coverage in place for their community service program once they institute it.

Ayes: Frische, Greeno, Hellmann, Niemeyer, Palmer, Russel, Slough, Warnecke, Wobser, Bauman. The Resolution was declared adopted and is recorded in Resolution Volume XXXV, and is hereby made a part of the record.

RESOLUTION NO. 025-2022 (no PO) requires one (1) reading

first reading - adopted

A RESOLUTION APPROVING THE EXPENDITURES MADE BY THE AUDITORS OFFICE ON THE ATTACHED LIST OF VOUCHERS WHICH EITHER EXCEED THE PURCHASE ORDER OR WERE INCURRED WITHOUT A PURCHASE ORDER EXCEEDING THE STATUTORY LIMIT OF THREE THOUSAND DOLLARS (\$3000.00) ALL IN ACCORDANCE WITH OHIO REVISED CODE 5705.41(D).

Councilman Wobser moved to adopt the Resolution, seconded by Councilman Hellmann. Ayes: Greeno, Hellmann, Niemeyer, Palmer, Russel, Slough, Warnecke, Wobser, Bauman, Frische. The Resolution was declared adopted and is recorded in Resolution Volume XXXV, and is hereby made a part of the record.

ORDINANCES:

ORDINANCE NO. 2022-076 (Law Director budget – more funds for legal svcs (pending litigation) requires three (3) readings

third reading – adopted

AN ORDINANCE APPROPRIATING FUNDS AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.

Councilman Slough moved to adopt the Ordinance, seconded by Councilman Palmer.

Discussion:

Councilwoman Warnecke asked how much higher this will go being that it is related to the Martens case. Acting Law Director Feighner replied that he discussed this with the Mayor and Service-Safety Director that the invoices for this case should be starting to decline as one of the last components has been settled and that there is not a lot of litigation left for it, but he is unsure what is left to pay on his lawsuits against the City, but that they should be wrapping up. He will let Law Director Rasmussen know that this was brought up tonight and ask him to inform Council on the status of his cases.

Councilwoman Frische pointed out that Law Director Rasmussen provided all of that information with the first reading of the ordinance and stated that this appropriation should cover it. He provided a breakdown of all the costs. She agrees that it is pricey and would like to see more of it done in-house instead of subbing it out, which is something that should be discussed down the road with a salary ordinance, but that Council does need to approve this Ordinance.

Ayes: Hellmann, Niemeyer, Palmer, Russel, Slough, Warnecke, Wobser, Bauman, Frische, Greeno. The Ordinance was declared adopted and is recorded in Ordinance Volume XXIII, Page 2022-076 and is hereby made a part of the record.

ORDINANCE NO. 2022-078 (Hancock Public Health combined services contract renewal) requires three (3) readings

third reading - adopted

AN ORDINANCE AMENDING ORDINANCE NO. 2021-107 TO AUTHORIZE THE MAYOR OF THE CITY OF FINDLAY, OHIO TO CONTINUE COMBINED HEALTH AND ENVIRONMENTAL SERVICES PROVIDED BY THE HANCOCK COUNTY GENERAL HEALTH DISTRICT AND CITY OF FINDLAY HEALTH DEPARTMENT, AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.

Councilman Hellmann moved to adopt the Ordinance, seconded by Councilman Baumann.

Discussion:

Councilwoman Frische pointed out that after some discussion at the last City Council meeting and after she requested to remove the three (3) year request for terminating the contract, she talked with a couple other Councilmembers who would like to see an annual review. It is a fair statement to say that the Health Department is no different than any other part of the City's divisions.

Councilwoman Frische moved to amend the Ordinance to remove the three (3) year out clause and have an annual review. Motion failed due to a lack of second to the motion.

Councilman Wobser noted that the idea Councilwoman Frische came up with is a valid one, but disagrees with it from the standpoint that if Council passes it tonight, but decides tomorrow that the City wants to no longer be a part of the agreement, it would take almost three (3) years to separate the two (2) entities (City and County Health Departments) and go back into the health business by ourselves. So, it is a three (3) year situation. He does not see what the City would gain by having a one (1) year contract, but does agree with Councilwoman Frische that one (1) year reviews are something he too would like to have done with Health Commissioner Karim Baroudi coming to City Council to provide an update and go through all the numbers of what the two (2) different boards are experience that are involved with running the joint Public Health Board, which covers the City, but it would still be nice for Council to review the numbers which would cover what Councilwoman Frische is trying to gain.

Councilman Hellmann agreed with Councilman Wobser of asking Health Commissioner Baroudi to provide Council with a review on an annual basis. If there is no contact for the Health Board, it provides some instability to the organization and to the employees that are there. Council does not want to instill those types of questions in people's minds.

Councilman Russel pointed out that the Health Director has numerous times, not only the last time he was before Council, but in all previous times he addressed Council, has offered to come and talk with Council either during a Council meeting or a COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE meeting to discuss the department. Whenever Council has asked, he has shown up.

Councilwoman Frische clarified that even though the City is not required to have a Health Department, it is still needed. The City has a fiduciary responsibility to make sure it's running to the best of its ability for the community. Council seems to agree that a one (1) year review is preferred. She asked if there is anything that hurts the City by removing the three (3) year clause. The City will not jump ship if they want out of the contract, but if costs get too high and the City is not getting their benefit, or is not happy with how the Health Department is running, or if one of the entities of the contract cannot pay, they will not be able to wait three (3) years to get out. She asked Acting Law Director Feighner how it hurts the City to remove the three (3) year clause and add in an annual review. She is looking at the benefit of the City first. Acting Law Director Feighner replied there is a contract in place now. If the City were to come in and decide to do something different, it will affect the contract as a whole.

This agreement is referred to as an evergreen agreement because it keeps on going and going as it automatically renews and does not change. What it should look like should

It may need to be looked at some time down the road on what it should look like and then propose that to all the members on what the out will be and what the timeframe will be. When the Mayor spoke on this last time, her concern was the timeframe for startup if the City were to go out on their own. If the City were to decide to stick around, there may have to be adjustments to the agreement.

Councilman Wobser believes that the only thing that would hurt the City is if the group were to be destabilized by cancelling and pulling out the end of the year. He asked Councilwoman Frische if she is asking for a one-year contract with a one-year out clause. Councilwoman Frische replied no. If the City were to go back to having its own Health Department, it would not happen at the end of the year and would probably take two to three (2-3) years to do so. If the City were to get into a financial situation where they could not pay their portion of the agreement, they should not have to wait three (3) years to terminate the contract. Health Commissioner Baroudi had mentioned how he is starting to work with Wyandot and Seneca, but that they are not paying yet, so Council should be reviewing those contracts and if they do come on board, it should reduce the City's portion of the agreement. There are reasons to have a discussion on an annual basis, and there is no reason to have a three (3) year out, especially in the situation that the City would want to go back to having their own separate Health Department where it would not happen tomorrow and would probably end up taking three (3) years to dissolve. Councilman Wobser asked Councilwoman Frische what she thinks the timeline would be for the scenario of what she would like to have the agreement changed to. Councilwoman Frische replied that a timeline is not needed. Councilman Wobser replied there has to be a timeline because it has to be stated in a contract when any entity can get out of the contract. He asked Councilwoman Frische if she thinks any entity should be able to get out of the contract at any point in time. Councilwoman Frische replied that there are many evergreen contracts for various services that are reviewed every year. Councilman Wobser noted that Councilwoman Frische is not asking for an evergreen contract for this and is asking for a one (1) year contract.

President of Council Pro-Tem Russel clarified that discussion amongst Councilmembers will be made one at a time and will not have questions given back and forth. The legislation on this is before Council tonight. Councilwoman Frische asked for the Ordinance to be amended that was not seconded. Conversations that are pertinent to the proposed legislation as presented will be permitted in which he will allow each Councilmember that has comments for discussion to be given the floor or tonight's meeting will continue to on with him calling the question.

Councilman Wobser feels this puts a premium on who the Mayor has asked to be on the board, which at the end of the day, they are the ones that review the numbers and processes in depth. When board members are appointed or are asked to be appointed, he is unsure if Council has to approve those appointments or not, but is where the City's safety net comes in on this contract. The City needs to make sure there are individuals that are going to look out for the City's best interest on that board.

Councilwoman Frische noted that she is not against having a Health Department, but will not support it with a three (3) year termination clause. She has no problem with being the lone ranger on this as she has done it before. It is not in the best interest of the City.

Ayes: Niemeyer, Palmer, Russel, Slough, Warnecke, Wobser, Bauman, Greeno, Hellmann. Nays: Frische. The Ordinance was declared adopted and is recorded in Ordinance Volume XXIII, Page 2022-078 and is hereby made a part of the record.

ORDINANCE NO. 2022-081 *(salary ordinance)* **requires three (3) readings** **second reading**

AN ORDINANCE ESTABLISHING JOB CLASSIFICATIONS, PAY RANGES, SALARY SCHEDULES AND OTHER MATTERS THAT MAY AFFECT PAY, FOR ALL NON-ELECTED OFFICERS AND EMPLOYEES OF THE CITY OF FINDLAY, OHIO, AND REPEALING ORDINANCE NO. 2021-116, ORDINANCE NO. 2022-011 AND ALL OTHER ORDINANCES AND/OR PARTS OF ORDINANCES IN CONFLICT HEREWITH, AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.

Second reading of the Ordinance.

ORDINANCE NO. 2022-086 *(OPWC grant application – Bernard Ave waterline replacement)* **requires three (3) readings** **first reading - adopted**

AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR, SERVICE-SAFETY DIRECTOR AND/OR CITY ENGINEER OF THE CITY OF FINDLAY, OHIO TO EXECUTE THE NECESSARY GRANT APPLICATION(S) AND/OR AGREEMENT(S) TO RECEIVE GRANT FUNDS FROM THE OHIO PUBLIC WORKS COMMISSION (OPWC) FOR THE BERNARD AVENUE WATERLINE REPLACEMENT PROJECT NO. 35724200, AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.

Councilman Palmer moved to suspend the statutory rules and give the Ordinance its second and third readings, seconded by Councilwoman Warnecke. Ayes: Palmer, Russel, Slough, Warnecke, Wobser, Bauman, Frische, Greeno, Hellmann, Niemeyer. Councilman Palmer moved to adopt the Ordinance, seconded by Councilman Wobser. Ayes: Russel, Slough, Warnecke, Wobser, Bauman, Frische, Greeno, Hellmann, Niemeyer, Palmer. The Ordinance was declared adopted and is recorded in Ordinance Volume XXIII, Page 2022-086 and is hereby made a part of the record.

ORDINANCE NO. 2022-087 *(W Lincoln St storm sewer)* **requires three (3) readings** **first reading**

AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR, SERVICE-SAFETY DIRECTOR, AND/OR CITY ENGINEER OF THE CITY OF FINDLAY, OHIO TO ENTER INTO A CONTRACT(S) FOR THE WEST LINCOLN STREET STORM SEWER PROJECT NO. 35521700, APPROPRIATING AND TRANSFERRING FUNDS, AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.

First reading of the Ordinance.

ORDINANCE NO. 2022-088 (*Engineering GPS Rover*) **requires three (3) readings**

first reading - adopted

AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR, SERVICE-SAFETY DIRECTOR AND/OR CITY ENGINEER OF THE CITY OF FINDLAY, OHIO TO ENTER INTO A CONTRACT(S) FOR A REPLACEMENT GPS ROVER PROJECT, APPROPRIATING AND TRANSFERRING FUNDS THERETO, AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.

Councilman Bauman moved to suspend the statutory rules and give the Ordinance its second and third readings, seconded by Councilwoman Frische. Ayes: Slough, Warnecke, Bauman, Frische, Greeno, Hellmann, Niemeyer, Palmer, Russel. Nays: Wobser. Councilman Bauman moved to adopt the Ordinance, seconded by Councilman Slough.

Discussion:

Councilwoman Frische *unable to hear audio livestream*

Ayes: Warnecke, Wobser, Bauman, Frische, Greeno, Hellmann, Niemeyer, Palmer, Russel, Slough. The Ordinance was declared adopted and is recorded in Ordinance Volume XXIII, Page 2022-088 and is hereby made a part of the record.

ORDINANCE NO. 2022-089 (*HAN-Greenway Trail, Phase II*) **requires three (3) readings**

first reading

AN ORDINANCE APPROPRIATING AND TRANSFERRING FUNDS, AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.

Discussion:

Councilwoman Frische *unable to hear audio livestream*

Councilwoman Frische moved to suspend the statutory rules and give the Ordinance its second and third readings, seconded by Councilman Palmer. Ayes: Bauman, Frische, Hellmann, Niemeyer, Palmer, Slough. Nays: Wobser, Greeno, Russel, Warnecke. Motion fails.

First reading of the Ordinance.

ORDINANCE NO. 2022-090 (*fire house bunk rooms*) **requires three (3) reading**

first reading

AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR, SERVICE-SAFETY DIRECTOR, AND/OR CITY ENGINEER OF THE CITY OF FINDLAY, OHIO TO ENTER INTO A CONTRACT(S) FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF INDIVIDUAL SLEEPING QUARTERS AT EACH CITY OF FINDLAY, OHIO FIRE STATIONS, APPROPRIATING AND TRANSFERRING FUNDS THERETO, AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.

First reading of the Ordinance.

ORDINANCE NO. 2022-091 (*fiber loop to the north & south water towers*) **requires three (3) readings**

first reading

AN ORDINANCE APPROPRIATING AND TRANSFERRING FUNDS AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.

First reading of the Ordinance.

ORDINANCE NO. 2022-092

first reading - adopted

(*OPWC grant application – Blanchard St waterline replacement Phase II*) **requires three (3) readings**

AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR, SERVICE-SAFETY DIRECTOR AND/OR CITY ENGINEER OF THE CITY OF FINDLAY, OHIO TO EXECUTE THE NECESSARY GRANT APPLICATION(S) AND/OR AGREEMENT(S) TO RECEIVE GRANT FUNDS FROM THE OHIO PUBLIC WORKS COMMISSION (OPWC) FOR THE BLANCHARD STREET WATERLINE REPLACEMENT PHASE II PROJECT, AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.

Councilman Palmer moved to suspend the statutory rules and give the Ordinance its second and third readings, seconded by Councilwoman Warnecke. Ayes: Frische, Greeno, Hellmann, Niemeyer, Palmer, Russel, Slough, Warnecke, Wobser, Bauman. Councilman Palmer moved to adopt the Ordinance, seconded by Councilman Greeno. Ayes: Greeno, Hellmann, Niemeyer, Palmer, Russel, Slough, Warnecke, Wobser, Bauman, Frische. The Ordinance was declared adopted and is recorded in Ordinance Volume XXIII, Page 2022-092 and is hereby made a part of the record.

ORDINANCE NO. 2022-093

first reading - adopted

(*2023 chemicals/materials/services contract renewal with Greer Lime Company*) **required three (3) readings**

AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE SERVICE-SAFETY DIRECTOR OF THE CITY OF FINDLAY, OHIO TO WAIVE THE FORMAL ADVERTISING AND BIDDING REQUIREMENTS AND ENTER INTO A CONTRACT(S) WITH GREER LIME COMPANY FOR THE PURCHASE OF PEBBLE LIME NEEDED BY THE CITY OF FINDLAY, OHIO FOR CALENDAR YEAR 2023, AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.

Discussion:

Councilman Russel asked *unable to hear audio livestream*

Service-Safety Director Martin replied *unable to hear audio livestream*

Councilman Hellmann moved to suspend the statutory rules and give the Ordinance its second and third readings, seconded by Councilwoman Warnecke. Ayes: Hellmann, Niemeyer, Palmer, Russel, Slough, Warnecke, Bauman, Greeno. Nays: Frische, Wobser. Councilman Slough moved to adopt the Ordinance, seconded by Councilman Bauman. Ayes: Niemeyer, Palmer, Russel, Slough, Warnecke, Wobser, Bauman, Greeno, Hellmann. Nays: Frische. The Ordinance was declared adopted and is recorded in Ordinance Volume XXIII, Page 2022-093 and is hereby made a part of the record.

ORDINANCE NO. 2022-094 (*liquid sodium permanganate*) **required three (3) readings**

first reading

AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE SERVICE-SAFETY DIRECTOR OF THE CITY OF FINDLAY, OHIO TO WAIVE THE FORMAL ADVERTISING AND BIDDING REQUIREMENTS AND ENTER INTO A CONTRACT(S) WITH CARUS LLC FOR THE PURCHASE OF LIQUID SODIUM PERMANGANATE NEEDED BY THE CITY OF FINDLAY, OHIO FOR CALENDAR YEAR 2023, AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.

Councilwoman Warnecke moved to suspend the statutory rules and give the Ordinance its second and third readings, seconded by Councilman Bauman. Ayes: Palmer, Slough, Warnecke, Bauman, Greeno, Hellmann. Nays: Russel, Wobser, Frische, Niemeyer. Motion failed.

First reading of the Ordinance.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS:

OLD BUSINESS:

Councilwoman Frische asked Councilman Wobser for a status of putting a process together for bidding projects that are less than fifty thousand dollars (\$50,000.00). Councilman Wobser replied that he has not worked on that process yet. He and City Auditor Staschiak are going to look into what other cities have done. The goal is to not limit the Administration for minimal amounts of dollars, but that there needs to be a reporting structure and when the project amount is less than the fifty thousand dollar (\$50,000.00), it will need to come to Council for some type of review.

Councilman Hellmann asked if the only two (2) items on the budget schedule that City Auditor provided that deal with City Council that City Auditor Staschiak are the items dated as September 27, 2022 and December 13-15, 2022. City Auditor Staschiak replied that he would hope that Council would take a serious interest in the budgeting process and would speak with the Administration and their departments to get a feel for the capital needs through the committee process. The Administration should be addressing this with Council with two (2) different committees WATER AND SEWER COMMITTEE or STREETS, SIDEWALKS & PARKING COMMITTEE where the different committees will report what they are doing for their budgeting process and what their requests and long-term needs might be. It is the purvey of Council how they would like to approach budgeting. His goal is to keep Council informed on what the deadlines are and how the process will progress. It is his hopes that all Councilmembers take a significant interest in the process being that they are the funding authority of the City. If Council does not fund the money, the Administration cannot take the action.

NEW BUSINESS:

Councilman Wobser: **APPROPRIATIONS COMMITTEE** meeting on Tuesday, September 20, 2022 at 5:30pm in the third floor conference room of the Municipal Building (CR1).

agenda: ARPA Fund use

Councilman Wobser: **COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE** meeting on Tuesday, September 27, 2022 at 4:00pm ~~5:00pm~~ in the third floor conference room of the Municipal Building (CR1).

agenda: 1. mid-year review
2. pre-budget hearings

Councilman Wobser: **STRATEGIC PLANNING COMMITTEE** meeting on Tuesday, September 13, 2022 from 3:00pm-5:00pm in the third floor conference room of the Municipal Building (CR1).

Councilman Russel: **PLANNING & ZONING COMMITTEE** meeting on Thursday, September 8, 2022 at 12:00pm in the first floor Council Office (CO).

agenda: S Blanchard Street vacation (tabled 8/11/22)

President Pro-Tem Russel noted that there has been a request to go back to the regular seating arrangement in the Council Chambers for City Council meetings and asked for a raising of hands of who would like to go back to regular seating vs continue with current seating beginning the next City Council meeting on September 20, 2022:

Discussion:

Councilman Palmer feels going back to the old arrangement would work better, especially when calling on Councilmembers who have something to say, it would be easier for the Council President to call on them. It makes the meetings move a little better.

Councilman Hellmann agreed with what Councilman Palmer just stated. He prefers to move back to the old seating arrangement.

Councilman Wobser noted that the last time President of Council Harrington brought this up, he had the same objection as at that point of time in that from a safety standpoint, COVID does not seem to be as big of a problem as it used to be, but continues to be an issue in the community and that Council meetings work well the way the seating arrangement is currently.

Councilwoman Warnecke agreed with Councilman Wobser.

return to regular seating: Bauman, Frische, Hellmann, Niemeyer, Palmer

continue with current seating: Greeno, Russel, Slough, Warnecke, Wobser

With a 5-5 vote, current seating will remain for the remainder of the year and then will be reviewed again in January.

Councilman Palmer apologized for cancelling today's **STREETS, SIDEWALKS & PARKING COMMITTEE** meeting on short notice. He received notice from the Administration over the weekend that all the information from them would not be available to properly conduct the meeting.

Councilman Slough moved to adjourn City Council at 8:06pm, seconded by Councilman Palmer. All were in favor.

CLERK OF COUNCIL

COUNCIL PRESIDENT PRO-TEM